SPRING 2021 • No. 34

IDEAS OF THE AUTHOR IN THE GERMAN MUSICAL BAROQUE REVIEW BY ESTHER CRISCUOLA DE LAIX (MADISON, WI)

BACH NOTES

NEWSLETTER OF THE AMERICAN BACH SOCIETY

Stephen Rose. <u>Musical Authorship from</u> <u>Schütz to Bach</u>. (Musical Performance and Reception.) Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019. ISBN: 978-1-108-42107-2 (cloth), \$99; 978-1-108-37295-4 (ebook), \$80. DOI: 10.1017/9781108363280.

Music in the Western art tradition leads a double life as sound and document. We use the word "music" to describe both the audible notes we play or sing and the written material carrying instructions for producing those notes ("don't forget to bring your music to school today"). From this double nature there naturally results a double notion of how music is *made*, created: on one hand, there are the performers who create the sounds, and on the other the composers whose *author*itative acts of writing down those sounds causes them to crystallize into "works" (a loaded term for another day). Musical *authorship*, of course, is the subject of the present book, which joins a distinguished lineage of scholarly work on this rich and fraught topic. Some scholars have sought to trace the history of the concept of the composer-as-author, relating it to other cultural changes like the rise of print or patronage (Wegman 1996; Feldman 2000). Others have reacted against the "great works and authors" model that has dominated the study of music history for so long (Goehr 1992, Taruskin 1995), while some more recent scholars have sought to decenter that model in favor of other types of histories (Cook 2013, van Orden 2014).



Rose's study does all these things and none of them. Bringing together a staggering wealth of archival material, all the major musical styles and genres of the period, and an impressive variety of sources (from Plato to Locke to Stephen Greenblatt), it offers a rich exploration of notions of musical creativity in a time and place that have been only rarely touched on in connection with the topic: the Lutheran German Baroque. The stated timeframe reaches approximately from the birth of Heinrich Schütz in 1585 through the death of J. S. Bach in 1750 (p. 7), with the Thirty Years' War (1618–48) looming as a dire not-quite-midpoint—though the discussion touches on several earlier figures as well (Josquin, Lassus, Hassler,

the various composers named Praetorius) and even a few who outlived Bach (Telemann, Krebs).

The aim of the book is neither to establish some kind of "rise of the author"

ABS Membership Renewal A friendly reminder to renew your membership for the year 2021 here: https://www.americanbachsociety. org/contact.html

In This Issue:

Review: Ideas of the Author in the
German Musical Baroque (Esther
Criscuola de Laix) 1
Review: Bach Updated (Raymond
Erickson)
Review: Realizing Thoroughbass Chorales
(Siavash Sabetrohani) 7
Review: Henry Wood and the Revival of
Bach in England (Alannah Rebekah
Franklin)
Announcements
Recent Publications 11
Marchan Name
Member News
@ 2021
© 2021
The American Bach Society

teleology nor to dismantle the notion of musical authorship altogether during these years. Even as Rose acknowledges that "the history of Lutheran music in the long seventeenth century resists any attempt to impose a narrative of strengthening musical authorship" (7), he clearly shows us that composers did regard themselves as authors (and, to some extent, their products as works), and that various notions of creativity and authorshipsome seemingly contradictory—coexisted: "Different notions of musical authorship were ... on display within a single church service during Bach's time in Leipzig" (186). There were of course significant shifts as well, many of them the result of the Thirty Years' War; one of the biggest was the decline of music printing in the wake of the war (mapped in figure I.2 on p. 8, discussed pp. 8-10). This decline, as Rose goes on to show (particularly in chapters 5 and 6), had a host of implications for style, performance, and reception. But many of the same underlying attitudes toward creativity persisted.

Laying the foundation for the rest of the book are the three concepts of musical creativity Rose describes and contextualizes in chapter 1 ("God, Talent, Craft: Concepts of Musical Creativity"), all of which existed side by side in early Lutheran Germany. They are: (1) the theological concept, by which God was regarded as the only true giver and creator of music, with human composers serving merely as a tool for finding that music-the literal meaning of the term inventio, which Rose unpacks later in the chapter; (2) the humanist concept, which drew on classical poetics to emphasize human composers' innate talent and ingenuity; and (3) the artisanal concept, by which music was regarded as a handcraft passed down from master to apprentice-emphasizing not only the physicality of musical practice but also a certain amount of secret knowledge. These concepts, particularly the humanistic and artisanal, recur in the chapters that follow, where Rose makes convincing use of them as frameworks for the developments and changes he examines. In the discourses of musical borrowing discussed in chapter 2 ("Between Imitatio and Plagiarism"), for example, the homage paid to an authoritative model via imitatio (e.g., Schütz's quotation of Giovanni Gabrieli's "Lieto godea" in a sacred concerto, duly labeled) was one form of an apprentice acknowledging a master, while Georg Quitschreiber's imitation treatise De parodia—admittedly a music-historical "one-off," as Rose notes (65)-praised composers who used their talents to improve preexisting compositions through the addition or reduction of voices. (An approach that at other times went horribly wrong, as Rose reminds us: the clunky and unsanctioned reductions of Schütz's concertos in the Geistliche wohlklingende Concerte anthologies of 1637-38 spurred the composer to redouble efforts to protect his compositions through imperial privileges; see pp. 70-73, 96, and 141.) Similarly, the composers' authentication marks discussed in chapter 3 (elaborate signatures, monograms on title pages, Schütz's specially made paper) are tied in to both

the artisanal practice of craftsmen's marks and monograms (like Albrecht Dürer's famous nested "AD") and the humanist idea of an inner nature detectable in external traits.

Such humanist and artisanal traces could even, Rose suggests, be found in "the music itself." The above-mentioned examples of borrowing, adaptation, and *imitatio* already show this, as does Rose's discussion of Johann Adam Reincken's infamously lengthy chorale fantasia on "An Wasserflüssen Babylon" (113-15), which the composer is said to have considered his "portrait" of sorts; whether or not one takes Rose's analysis as conclusive evidence (all the characteristics he notes are standard enough features of seventeenth-century North German organ repertoire), he certainly offers a new way of understanding this prolix piece. Chapter 6, "Authorship and Performance," takes these ideas to the next level in examining the way authorship (or at least musical creativity) was seen to manifest itself in performance. Here, too, differing attitudes coexisted, as did the humanist and artisanal approaches. Thus Johann Hermann Schein provided a long list of vocal and instrumental performing options for the three-voice villanellas of his Musica boscareccia (1621, 1626, and 1628; pp. 194–95), and Tobias Michael (1637) and Johann Beer ("around 1690," according to p. 197, posthumously published in 1719 as Musicalische Discurse) left ornamentation, performing forces, and interpretation up to performers' own tastes and



talents (197–99), but Johann Jakob Froberger's keyboard works had the reputation of being impossible to learn fully except from the composer himself-and thus in a completely embodied, thoroughly artisanal manner (201). One of this chapter's strengths is its reframing of contemporary discourse about performance, style, and ornamentation—discourse well known and near-commonplace to scholars of German Baroque music—in terms of musical authorship and creativity. Thus, when Schein laid out his list of performance options, when Andreas Hammerschmidt decried "debased, ugly coloratura" (1671, p. 206), or when Johann Adolph Scheibe blasted J. S. Bach for expecting performers "to do with their throats and instruments whatever he can play on the clavier" (211), they were not only making aesthetic pronouncements. They were also articulating differing expectations for the role of performers in realizing the composer's intentions (another loaded topic for another day).

Other factors were at work too, of course. In chapter 4, "Rites of Musical Ownership," Rose shows how German Baroque discourses around musical ownership-composers' and publishers' rights to control the dissemination of musical compositions-were rooted in potentially conflicting notions: the Lutheran ideal of sharing one's talents for the common good on one hand (from which princely courts were notably exempt), and the self-interest inherent in early capitalism on the other-which, as he aptly points out, was likewise an essential feature of the artisanal culture surrounding instrumental music and practice (122). In chapter 5, "The Regulation of Novelty," which traces shifts in attitudes toward musical novelty over the time period covered by the book, Rose draws on both Lutheran and Platonic concepts of social order to contextualize a Saxon ordinance of 1580 that forbade cantors and organists from performing their own compositions in church; they were instead restricted to the "old, outstanding composers" like Josquin, Clemens non Papa, and Lassus (164). But the years following the Thirty Years' War, in contrast, saw the rise of the prolific cantor-composer who drew on modern, local tastes to create new music for each week's service-a shift which Rose links to an "increased emphasis on the consumption of fashionable goods" (177) in imitation of court culture. In this view, the weekly cantatas of Knüpfer, Kuhnau, and Bach were ephemeral luxury goods that were as reflective of current taste and fashion as they were of their composers' or listeners' personal piety. This chapter is perhaps the one place where Rose comes dangerously close to a teleology, but he stops short at the end: even Bach, he notes, had his students sing the same High Renaissance "standards" recommended in the ordinance of some 150 years before (186).

Rose's discussion of printing privileges in chapter 4 forms a centerpiece not only to that chapter but arguably to the entire book. Drawing on Saxon and imperial archival sources, he paints a detailed picture of the processes by which privileges were applied for, approved (or not), and worked (or not). Particularly 3

valuable to his discussion are tables 4.1 and 4.2 (128-31), listing information on privileges held by composers and music publishers in the German-speaking lands from 1550 to 1700. (One formatting nitpick: in table 4.2, which names publishers, I would have switched the position of the "Composer/editor" and "Publisher (place)" columns, or else not set the composers' names in all-caps; otherwise this table looks too similar to table 4.1.) His evidence complicates the anachronistic idea that privileges constituted an assertion of intellectual rights in the modern sense. Instead, it reveals that many composers and publishers applied for privileges out of a sense of duty to share their work and talents, or for the practical ends of financial protection. Rose's findings further emphasize that privileges could be more restrictive than permissive; see, for example, those granted to publishers in the very Protestant, very Hanseatic city of Hamburg, stipulating "that the songs should contain nothing ... that is scandalous or opposed to Roman Catholic Orthodoxy, or the imperial constitution" (134). Moreover, privileges were by no means always successful in preventing the production of unauthorized editions, including works by Schütz, Schein, and Heinrich Albert (140-48). Rose's thorough discussion is essential reading for anyone studying early modern music printing privileges, whether in the German-speaking lands or elsewhere.

Through the lens of authorship and musical creativity, *Musical Authorship from Schütz to Bach* offers genuinely new perspectives on the music of the German Baroque, revealing fascinating complexities (and even contradictions) in a musical era too often considered straightlaced and stodgy. It is a dense and detailed read thanks to the many primary sources cited, but not a single one is out of place; even those that have typically been regarded as mere clichés of their time—Mattheson's ruminations, Walther's anecdotes, Bach's "SDG" inscriptions, and everyone's dedicatory prefaces—are all convincingly shown to reflect larger cultural, social, and economic currents. Kudos to Stephen Rose for crafting this impressive and important work, which belongs on the shelves of musicologists, performers, and anyone interested in the intersections of musical and material culture.

Review: Bach Updated Raymond Erickson (Queens College and The Graduate Center, CUNY)

David Schulenberg. <u>Bach</u>. (The Master Musicians.) New York: Oxford University Press, 2020. pp. xi, 413. ISBN:978-0-190936-303 (hardcover), \$35; 978-0-190936-327 (ebook), \$24.

In the preface to his new biography of J. S. Bach, David Schulenberg credits Malcolm Boyd's *Bach*, which his own eponymous volume replaces in Oxford's Master Musicians se-

ries, as being "ideal for its time and its readers in the balanced presentation of life and works, of fact and opinion." In the volume under review, Schulenberg meets that standard for today not only by utilizing recently won knowledge about Bach and his music, but also by harnessing the possibilities of the internet, which has changed the traditional concept of a published book. Consequently, unlike Boyd's volume, first issued in 1983 and last updated in 2000, this one has a companion website containing supplementary materials such as audio examples, a guide to sources, a glossary, and other resources.

It will not surprise anyone that Schulenberg is a trustworthy and reliable guide through the thickets presented by the vast materials on "arguably the greatest musician to have lived in the Western world, perhaps anywhere" (1), and any caveats expressed in this review are to be understood in that context. After all, Schulenberg has become the central biographer in English

of the Bach family, having also authored well-received books on Wilhelm Friedemann and Carl Philipp Emanuel, not to mention the standard treatment of their father's keyboard music and a wide range of other specialized studies. His presentation here, suitable for a broad readership, is straightforward and honest and happily devoid of excessive speculation and academic jargon. Occasionally a subtle wit is revealed, as in the characterization of the Bach-Marchand duel as "one of the most famous non-events in European music history" (89). Schulenberg has undertaken this volume after decades of work with primary sources and with a comprehensive command of secondary sources, further aided by the insights of being an interpreter, notably as harpsichordist, of Bach's music. Even his strong background in classical languages (of which I am aware from another context) is relevant, because Bach's education was centered in the classics as well as, of course, Lutheran theology.

> Bookended by chapters titled "Bach in History: Geography, Society, Culture" and "Legacy," the main text consists of paired chapters, the first of each offering primarily biographical information concerning a specific stage in Bach's life and career and the second, longer chapter focusing mainly on the music composed at the time. Thus the biographical chapter 6, "Weimar (1708–1717)," is followed by one on "Bach the Concertmaster: Chorales and Cantatas." However, these titles do not always precisely reflect content. Chapter 7 in fact continues the discussion of organ music begun in chapter 5 ("Bach the Organist: Early Keyboard and Vocal works") before going on to chorale preludes and the Weimar cantatas. Moreover, chapter 13, "Bach the Teacher: Publications and Pedagogy," devotes only a fraction of the space to Bach as teacher (which is also treated in other chapters), and focuses mainly on the later works, from the Clavierübung through the Mass in B Minor. This reflects

the difficulty of presenting Bach's enormous and varied output in some logical way within 340 pages, especially when many works and activities cross boundaries between one life station and another. Following the main text are a calendar listing important moments in Bach's life (and usefully, his age at the time) and other events dealing with general history, music, and Bach's contemporaries; a list of works in groupings that generally follow Schmieder's BWV numbering and classifications; personalia



(with one-sentence identifications); bibliography; and an (in my view inadequate) index.

Although there are many personal insights and measured speculations in this book, they do not fundamentally alter our present view of Bach. However, along with the biographical information and (non-technical) analyses of the music come some welcome new emphases, such as the intertwining lives and careers of Bach and Telemann scattered throughout the text and the attention given to women. One also encounters many useful and even provocative tidbits along the way, including the reminder that March 21, when Bach's birthday is celebrated, is the date under the former Julian calendar; he says this corresponds to April 1 of the modern (Gregorian) calendar (9), although sources I have consulted give March 31.

There are also some terminological issues deserving comment. For example, "stem duchy" (5) referring to medieval Saxony, really has no relevance for Bach; more helpful would have been a discussion of the unmentioned Wettin family and its division into the Ernestine branch (which ruled Thuringian duchies like Eisenach and Weimar) and the Albertine branch (which ruled electoral Saxony, including Dresden, Leipzig, and-except as an independent duchy from 1656 to 1746-Weissenfels.) Another problematic term is Trauerode (206), which Schulenberg applies to BWV 198; however, that title properly refers to Gottsched's original text in the form of a classical ode, which Bach thoroughly dismantled while recasting it into opera-style recitatives and arias. The actual title Bach gives the final work is Trauermusik. Schulenberg also makes the interesting point that Bach's Leipzig title Director musices was not official, unlike Cantor (the title used in city council discussions of the position), even if the Thomascantor still had responsibility for all the music at the main city churches and for certain civic events (214). But then he says that "a peculiarity of Bach's Leipzig position was that the city music director was also cantor;" perhaps it should be the other way around?

Another issue is the term "suite," which for Bach meant something very particular. Schulenberg correctly points out that the word was generally eschewed by French composers, but he says that "Bach's idea ... depended on that found in publications by Kuhnau and Fischer, perhaps also in the posthumously printed keyboard works of Froberger" (166). That is true when "suite" is understood in the general sense used today, but in fact the composers mentioned-and essentially all other German composers-did not use that term as a title for such published multi-movement works, instead calling them Partien or Partitas, if they had an overall title at all. (An exception is the German edition of Mattheson's London set of suites in 1714, cited by Schulenberg, but no doubt because "suite" was common terminology in England.) Bach's almost unique use of the term seems to have come from the French-born, London-based François (Charles) Dieupart, whose Six Suittes de Clavecin (Amsterdam,

1701) Bach copied before composing his mature suites. All works in Dieupart's collection have the sequence allemande, courante, sarabande, two other dances, and gigue preceded by a prelude (for Dieupart always a French overture). This is also Bach's basic format for the Suites for Cello, English Suites, and French Suites (save for the missing prelude in the latter, which could be improvised). Suite-like works not so organized Bach called Partita (or Partie) and Ouverture.

In the matter of instruments, Schulenberg makes clear for the modern reader the central role that organs played in the status of a church or town in Bach's Germany and their impact on the people who lived there, describing it as "the single most expensive and technologically advanced piece of equipment owned by the municipality" and "with the possible exception of church bells ... one of the loudest things in the city" (49). Schulenberg discusses in some detail the organs of Bach's time, Bach's recommendations for rebuilding, his procedures for testing organs, and his taste in registration (50). Furthermore, he points out that it is not clear that much of Bach's written-out organ music was actually played in services, since improvisation played so great a role (47); on the other hand, Bach is known to have played fully-composed pieces to get his improvisatory imagination in gear (56). On the question of whether the early manualiter toccatas might originally have been intended for organ, Schulenberg demurs, arguing for the harpsichord (105). Finally, in the continuing controversy over the iconic Toccata and Fugue in D Minor (BWV 565), Schulenberg's position is against Bach's authorship, suggesting in the list of works that it is by "?Kellner." He cites Peter Williams (1981) and Rolf Dietrich Claus (1998) as doubting BWV 565's authenticity but not Christoph Wolff (2002), who supports it, or Jonathan B. Hall (2013), who proposes Heinrich Dretzel as composer.

Many of Bach's works have developed modern performance traditions that reflect a lack of understanding of Baroque meter signatures, tempo, and implied character. One good example of that is the Prélude to the Fifth Cello Suite, which Schulenberg rightly points out is really a French Overture (173), a fact lost on virtually every cellist, even many early music specialists. Another almost universal misunderstanding concerns the *omnes generationes* section of the Magnificat (BWV 243), where, as Schulenberg notes following Robert Cammarota, modern performers always increase the tempo at *generationes* despite no indication that this should be done (323–24).

Of course, the hottest performance practice topic related to Bach has been the size of his forces in Leipzig. Here Schulenberg sides with Joshua Rifkin and Andrew Parrott (contrary views are totally uncited), except that he does admit the possibility of doubling: "there is simply no evidence that church works such as Bach's cantatas were sung during his lifetime by more than two voices to a part, usually only one" (46, n7). Surprisingly, however, he does not bring up the tradition of four *Cantorei*, each of eight singers, drawn from the fifty-five *alumni* (boarding students of the Thomasschule); the first of these served as the core of the first choir and hence would have been the foundation of the performing group singing (and perhaps playing) Bach's regular church music. (Maul, *Bach's Famous Choir*, trans. Howe [Boydell, 2018], 76–87.)

The book also leaves room for elaboration on various aspects of Bach's education. Schulenberg's statement that there is no documentation of what Bach studied at the Particularschule of St. Michael's in Lüneburg is not quite true (14). Regulations promulgated in 1656 had established a humanistic curriculum and in 1700-1 instruction in the prima grade (where presumably Bach was enrolled) was covered by the Rector Johannes Büsche (religion, logic, rhetoric, arithmetic, Cicero's orations, and Latin poets) and Conrector Eberhard Joachim Elfeld (Greek grammar, New Testament, Readings in Greek, and letters of Cicero, Terentius, and Horatius). Moreover, the separate Ritterakademie, briefly mentioned by Schulenberg, had by then become a kind of French finishing school for young aristocrats. Its noble students until 1665 had been taught by the Rector and Conrector of St. Michael's, but then acquired a new, French-oriented professorial staff. This is important because French court dance (taught by dancing-master Thomas de la Selle) was part of the curriculum there. French played enough of a role that in 1705 the noble students put on a Molière play in the original language. This then leads to the (as yet unanswerable) questions of how much contact Bach had with French culture in Lüneburg and whether he observed or perhaps musically accompanied dance classes for the noble youth, giving him first-hand knowledge of the dances he would stylize in his suites.

The issue of dance is also problematic for the Cöthen period (1717-23), when Bach produced most of his suites. The fact that Leopold was a Calvinist and that Calvinists rejected dancing as immoral invites the question of why there was a dancing master at Leopold's court. This is probably related to another important issue not discussed in the book: the struggle between the Calvinist Leopold and his strong-minded and strictly Orthodox Lutheran mother Gisela Agnes for dominance at court, for Gisela Agnes continued to compete for authority even after Leopold assumed power after her regency. Consequently, Leopold used Calvinism as a political weapon against his mother and her Lutheran supporters. (In 1718 he ordered that all baptisms and weddings of court personnel be held in the palace chapel, Bach excepted.) Nonetheless, his love of and dedication to music (and apparently dance) speaks against an absolute commitment to Calvinism itself; indeed, in 1708 he had danced in a Berlin production of the opera Alexander und Roxane by Augustin Reinhard Stricker. His determined independence may also be reflected in the wellknown portrait of him standing, clothed in armor and ermine, but without the normally de rigueur peruke (Fig. 8.1). In any event, there were court balls, presumably with the princely band directed by Court Music Director Bach, in the "Alte-Saal" or "Große-Saal"; however, its current form, with a much higher ceiling, as a "Hall of Mirrors," as Schulenberg refers to it (132), dates only from 1823. Decorated with forty-three mythological and still-life paintings, it was also the site of concerts twice a month in Bach's time. There was also a centrally placed ceremonial bed ("Himmelsbett," named for its painted view of heaven on the baldacchino), where Leopold, apparently already dressed, would be formally "awakened" each morning, perhaps with the accompaniment of music (led by Bach?). Leopold actually slept in his private apartment in another wing of the palace, where his private music was performed.

Finally, beyond these terminological issues, Schulenberg does not, in my view, put enough stress on the situation that Bach unwittingly walked into upon accepting the position as Thomascantor. One of the stunning discoveries of Michael Maul's research on the history of the Thomaner is that major changes to the regulations of the school had been made and approved, but not yet publicly announced nor shared with Bach, until after he signed his contract. The most important of the changes was that no longer was musical ability an absolute prerequisite for admission to the St Thomas School; this earlier requirement had catapulted the school into national renown and earned the Leipzig City councilmen and "their famous choir" distinctions such as the dedication by Heinrich Schütz of his Geistliche Chormusik (1648). Surely the reputation of the Thomaner must have been an important factor in Bach's willingness to trade the high status of Court Music Director for a lower-ranked position in Leipzig. In Schulenberg's telling, the consequences of the demotion in the cantor's authority were not evident until the arrival of Johann August Ernesti as rector in 1734 (268ff), but Bach must have been disillusioned at the outset of his tenure at Leipzig upon learning of his diminished role in admissions; moreover, as Maul has suggested, Bach's extraordinary production of cantatas early in his tenure may have been an effort to demonstrate the need to maintain the traditional standards of the choir that began to fall gradually after his arrival.

These comments, made with the understanding that a book of this kind cannot possibly cover everything, in no way detract from Schulenberg's achievement. He offers a comprehensive, useful, and insightful path to the understanding of Johann Sebastian Bach, both the man and the artist. The volume will deservedly become a standard biography with a wide readership.

Note: The reviewer acknowledges with thanks helpful information received from Ulfert Tschirner (Museum-Lüneburg) and Christian Erdmann (Köthen Kultur und Marketing, GmbH).

Editor's Note: David Schulenberg's *Bach* will be this year's ABS member gift.

Review: Realizing Thoroughbass Chorales Siavash Sabetrohani (University of Chicago)

Derek Remeš. Realizing Thoroughbass Chorales in the Circle of J. S. Bach. 2 Vols. In Collaboration with Robin A. Leaver. Colfax, NC: Wayne Leupold Editions, 2019. pp. Vol. 1: x, 146, Vol. 2: x, 134. WL500042 (paperback), \$99.

the trio of C. P. E. Bach (who moved from Berlin to Hamburg in 1768), Kirnberger (about whose alleged studies with Bach much remains to be discovered), and Göttingen-based Forkel (who was a budding historian and the youngest of them all).

century, when Bach's style of

composition became the prime

model for students to emulate.

With the advent of the histori-

"The writing out of thoroughbass and the introduction to chorales is without doubt the best method of learning composition, regarding harmony." Written in a letter by C. P. E. Bach to Forkel detailing J. S. Bach's teaching practice, these famous lines outline some of the most essential points in reconstructing the Leipzig master's pedagogy. The anecdote also serves as the backbone of Derek Remeš's Realizing Thoroughbass Chorales in the Circle of J. S. Bach, written in collaboration with Robin Leaver. In the book's introduction, Remeš and Leaver highlight the role of thoroughbass, particularly Heinichen's treatise, in Bach's pedagogy, a role much more extensive than previously assumed. Given the complexity of Heinichen's work, however, they argue that for beginners, Bach would have turned to David Kellner's thoroughbass

treatise, which they consider a digest of Heinichen's.

Throughout his life, Bach taught a large number of composers, though until recently there was little evidence to reconstruct his pedagogy. Since he did not leave a composition treatise behind, codifying Bach's pedagogy has become something of a "holy grail" among music theorists ever since his death. At first, his legacy was carried on through his two sons, C. P. E. and W. F. Bach, as well as a handful of loyal students and acquaintances largely centered in Berlin. The conservative branch of music theorists active in Berlin-who, among other factors, were driven by nationalistic sentiments prevalent at the time in Germany-advocated for teaching a purely German style of composition, with Bach as its epitome. The most important of these figures were

Each of them played a major role in promoting and branding Bach's music as a model. Their efforts bore signifi-WL500037 cant fruit in the nineteenth

Realizing Thoroughbass Chorales in the Circle of J. S. Bach

> addition to this growing literature. Remeš has drawn upon some significant new sources unearthed in recent years that help to give a better picture of Bach's compositional pedagogy.

> Probably the most dramatic of these discoveries was the Sibley Chorale Book (SCB), which Robin Leaver has connected closely to the circle of J. S. Bach, likely one of his competent students. (As the authors state in the introduction to the series, the details of the attribution of the SCB have been described in Leaver's article in Bach Perspectives 10.) But there are other sources—both manuscript and published-that Remeš draws together in his book that he claims give us as close a look as we may ever have to the inside of Bach's teaching studio.

Of the two volumes, the first includes a short primer on





thoroughbass by Remeš himself, then the translation of a number of primary sources on thoroughbass including C. P. E. Bach's *New Melodies* (1787). In his own short primer, Remeš strikes a fine balance between historical and practical materials. The volume also includes new translations of two documents by J. S. Bach and his students that have appeared in other publications as well: "Some rules of thoroughbass" from Anna Magdalena's 1725 music book, and the final two sections of the 1738 manuscript *Vorschriften und Grundsätze*, believed to originate from the Bach circle.



An interesting section of the book comprises an edition of C. P. E. Bach's New Melodies to Some Songs in the New Hamburg Chorale Book, published in Hamburg one year before his death. Here the fourteen chorales are accompanied with some editorial amendments (such as changing the original keys) aimed at making them more accessible to present-day beginners. These chorales, which later appeared as an appendix to the seventh edition of Kellner's treatise, provide a nice link between the two main aspects of the book, namely thoroughbass and chorales. The first volume ends with a translation of the second edition of Kellner's thoroughbass treatise, perhaps the most disseminated treatise of its kind in the eighteenth-century German world. The second volume presents the 227 chorales of the SCB in a modern edition with helpful editorial comments and corrections that aid the reader in their realization. Although the authors include simple realization for all of C. P. E. Bach's New Melodies, they have opted not to do the same with the chorales from the SCB.

As evident from the materials included in the first volume, the book is geared towards beginners with little prior experience with thoroughbass. Sometimes, however, the balance between historical accuracy and modern pedagogy seems difficult to maintain. On more than one occasion, Remeš goes to great lengths in order to stick with the historical way of thinking and avoiding "modern" concepts such as chord inversions. For example, in the discussion of "the 6/5 chord with perfect 5" (p. 6), Remeš argues that, despite all intervals being consonant against the bass, "the 5 is made to act like a dissonance because it forms a dissonance against the 6." A contemporary reader would probably have an easier time if it were explained that the perfect 5 above the bass is indeed the seventh of the chord and therefore needs to resolve down. Moreover, some of the arguments made in order to draw relations to Bach's pedagogy seem far-fetched. As an example, in the introduction, the authors take the fact that Telemann and Bach knew each other as evidence suggesting that "the two may have been of a similar mind regarding theoretical and pedagogical matters." While that may be true, sheer collegiality and having spent time together cannot always be taken as an argument for like-mindedness in matters of music. After all, Handel and Mattheson also knew each other in their youth, but their opinions on music were often very different! In line with the book's emphasis on pedagogy, one wonders if it might have been helpful to include at least one example of a famous chorale from the SCB (e.g., "Nun komm, der Heiden Heiland") with various realizations by Bach himself. Furthermore, the eclecticism resulting from juxtaposing various primary sources with Remeš's own materials may irritate some readers.

Yet, apart from these minor issues, the book offers a solid work of scholarship and pedagogy that can serve a range of purposes. One of the refreshing aspects of the book is Remeš's use of historical concepts and nomenclature (see, for example, his discussion of *syncopation* [suspension] and *transitus* [passing/ neighbor note], pp. 13–14). Furthermore, Remeš's comments on his own realizations of C. P. E. Bach's *New Melodies* highlight the pedagogical scope of the publication. While its relatively high price may seem regrettable, the superior quality of the print which includes beautiful facsimile reproductions—justifies it to a great extent. The few misprints and typos are also addressed in Remeš's helpful list of errata on his website: <u>https://derekremes. com/publications/errata/</u>.

"His method is the best, as it goes step by step from the easiest to the most difficult... It is for this reason that I consider Johann Sebastian Bach's method as unique and the best." So wrote Johann Philipp Kirnberger in his 1782 treatise on composition. While for many scholars and musicians, reconstructing J. S. Bach's pedagogy may always remain a holy grail, *Realizing* Thoroughbass Chorales in the Circle of J. S. Bach, with its delicate balance of historical and pedagogical resources helps us get ever closer! Whether or not one agrees with Kirnberger's claim about the superiority of Bach's pedagogy, Remes's book serves as a welcome addition that can benefit musicians and theorists alike. One could also imagine future publications that would deal with the next steps in Bach's pedagogy: setting sample bass lines to chorale melodies and most especially writing fugues. It is to be hoped that further research by Remeš and others continue to illuminate more aspects of J. S. Bach's pedagogy.

Review: Henry Wood and the Revival of Bach in England Alannah Rebekah Franklin (Florida State University)

Hannah French. *Sir Henry Wood: Champion of J. S. Bach.* Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2019. pp. xxv, 327. ISBN: 978-1-78327-3850 (hardcover), \$95; 978-1-78744-4959 (ebook), \$25.

Hannah French's book provides a detailed archival study of the life and work of the English Promenade Concerts ("Proms") conductor and co-founder Sir Henry Wood (1869-1944), tracing his long exploration and performance of Bach's music from multiple angles. This is not just a biography of Wood but a study of Bach's music in England during Wood's lifetime, using his own advocacy of Bach as a point of departure. French argues for Wood's importance not just as a co-founder and conductor of the Proms, but as a key figure in the revitalization of Bach's music and its growing popularity in Britain, especially through his Proms performances, 1895-1944. French also supplies a history of late nineteenth and early twentieth-century performances and the reception history of Bach's music in England, as well as the history of arranging Bach's music for nineteenth-century English orchestras. The book is notable for

its deep insights into English concert repertoire during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. In addition, it contributes to critical biography, performance practice studies, British cultural history, and Bach reception history. French presents Wood as a musician with many talents who conducted more than 700 works by over 350 composers. Wood was so keenly interested in Bach's music that he transcribed, arranged, and recorded it for British audiences (3). Using Wood as both subject and lens, French tells the story of Bach's music in British culture, providing key insights into the larger body of English orchestral literature and the early music movement during Wood's lifetime.

The structure of the book allows readers to "meet" Wood on a number of levels. He is presented as a conductor, composer, arranger, performer, and promoter of Bach. The book consists of five large parts, subdivided into chapters. The first part, "Contextualising," includes the book's introduction and a chapter on "Bach in Pre-Proms England." French delineates the performance history of Bach in nineteenth-century England, and introduces Wood as an important character contributing to the popularity of both Bach's music and early music in general.

> In Part II, French focuses on how Bach's music fit within the standard fare of orchestral music of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries by composers such as Elgar, Beethoven, Brahms, Mahler, Mendelssohn, Schubert, Schumann, and Arthur Sullivan ("Orchestral Bach at the Proms"). It also highlights the people who performed Bach, from Wood himself ("Wood's Encounter with Bach") to the orchestra players who became well known for their involvement with Bach's music ("Wood's Bach Players"). French interweaves Wood's Bach legacy with the careers of his performers, including violinists Arthur W. Payne, Henri Verbrugghen, Charles Woodhouse, Marie Wilson, and Paul Beard; wind players including Albert Fransella, Robert Murchie, Gordon Walker, Henri de Busscher, and Léon Goossens; and trumpet players Walter Morrow and Francis L. Gyp, among others. This large group of musicians interested

in Bach's music is exhibited along with Wood's performance practice decisions, further exemplifying the rising popularity of early music during this time period.

In Part III, "Interpreting: Orchestral Works," French provides insights into Wood's personal connections with Bach's music and his goals for bringing that music to the British public. She explores Wood's particular stylistic tendencies and personal preferences for interpreting Bach's music by examining his own performing scores and their markings. French also describes and compares various Bach recordings by Wood and other famous conductors of the time (Eugène Goossens, Wilhelm Furtwängler, Alfred Cortot, Adolf Busch, Paul Schmitz, and Alois Melichar, to name a few), focusing on differences in tempo, articulation, dynamics, and overall style. In chapters titled, "An Editorial Project" and "Orchestral Arrangements," she then discusses Wood's



editions of several Brandenburg Concertos and his arrangement of the orchestral suites. For Boosey & Hawkes, Wood edited the first and third Brandenburg Concertos, while his colleague Paul Beard finished the others after his death "using Wood's heavily marked-up scores" (148). Wood also arranged Bach's four orchestral suites (BWV 1066-69) and added two more to the repertoire by mixing, matching, and arranging movements of Bach's solo keyboard and violin music. He also transcribed numerous popular organ works for orchestra, including the Toccata and Fugue in D minor (BWV 565). While not the only Bach arrangements in England or Europe, Wood's were tailored to his specific ensembles and concert or recording contexts. For instance, knowing the limitations of early recording equipment and the sound quality of contemporary records, Wood arranged the third and sixth Brandenburg Concertos for strings alone for best effect (95). These recordings are important to musical scholarship generally as examples of a conductor's adaptation of scores to suit the needs of their ensembles, audiences, and technologies.

In Part IV, "Interpreting: Vocal Works," French discusses Wood's arrangements and performances of Bach's cantatas at the Proms as well as his presentations of the Passions and the Mass in B Minor at the Sheffield Musical Festival. The final section, "Influencing," parses out the reception history of Wood's specific Bach interpretations and then documents "Wood's Bach Legacy." French argues that Wood approached Bach's music "driven above all by his response to the expression in the music" (242), rather than out of a sense of obligation to follow only the notation in the scores like many in the early music movement in the midtwentieth century. In other words, he took a personal approach to Bach. While critics and audiences were not always receptive to his artistic preferences, as French points out, "Wood's role in the English Bach revival was ultimately that of the educator" (268). He presented Bach's music to British audiences, asking them to listen and experience the work of an eighteenth-century composer in their own time but through his own musical interpretation. In short, she argues, Wood contributed in important ways to the revitalization of Bach's music (268). A brief Epilogue sums up French's assessment of Wood's relationship to Bach, as depicted in the images of a stained-glass window (part of which appears on the book's cover) in the Musicians' Chapel of St Sepulchre's, London, beneath which the conductor is buried-an appropriate conclusion.

One of the book's strengths is its rootedness in archival material. French meticulously documents and analyzes the contents of what she names the "Wood Archive," held at the Royal Academy of Music, London. Her deep knowledge of the contents of the Wood Archive is apparent throughout the book, enlivening her discussion of Wood's career. The book showcases beautiful images of Wood's annotated scores, and includes further performance notes such as sketches of orchestral seating charts, lists of personnel pinned to his scores, and his own realizations of figured bass lines. Since French references Wood's use of a "blue pencil" (71) for certain notes and designations, it would have been helpful to actually see the juxtaposition of colors on the score. Writings by Wood and his family on Bach and the British concert scene during his lifetime are also featured as foundational resources. In addition, French created numerous, detailed graphs and tables. These give statistics on repertoire performed across Wood's career, tempo variations between conductors, and analysis of Bach's music as arranged by different composers and conductors, as well as numbers of instrumentalists used in solo sections of Wood's Brandenburg Concerto performances.

Most importantly, French's archival work offers a vivid portrait of public concert life in England during Wood's lifetime, especially as pertains to the performance of Bach's music at the Proms concerts. The book's detailed appendices contain extensive lists and tables on Bach and the reception of his music in British culture, including performances of Bach's orchestral music by the orchestra of the Bach Choir (1884-1944), performances of Bach at the Proms (1895-1944), and performances of the Brandenburg Concertos and orchestral suites at the Proms (1945-2018). The appendices also transcribe Wood's 1901 lecture on Bach's biography, present financial information for the 1941 Promenades, feature a list of other arrangers and transcribers of Bach's music before and during Wood's lifetime, and much more. While the appendices and in-text archival images are excellent resources, a stronger sense of narrative guidance from French would have also been useful. She provides intricate details and performative analyses, but the sheer amount of archival information may be overwhelming without further guidance from French as to its importance.

French balances the multiple sides of Wood's career, presenting him as a conductor, transcriber, arranger, and Bach advocate, an account that avoids mere hagiography for the conductor's role in reviving Bach. French includes personal details from Wood's own autobiography that showcase his desire to be associated with Bach's legacy: "He had a precocious talent for the organ, and although his autobiographical account of acquiring candles to study keyboard works late into the night chimes suspiciously with the story of Bach doing the same at the house of his older brother Johann Christoph, Bach dominates Wood's memory of his significant youthful performances" (27). While this story would be a fantastic point of connection, if true, French reminds us that even if autobiographical details such as these are made of fantasy, they do convey Wood's desire to be deeply connected to a composer he admired. In some ways, this makes him all the more relatable.

Announcements

Christoph Wolff and Hans-Joachim Schulze awarded the 2021 Bach Medal of the City of Leipzig

From the Bach-Archiv Leipzig: The Bach Medal of the City of Leipzig will go to two of the leading musicologists of our time: Prof. Dr. Dr. h. c. mult. Christoph Wolff (b. 1940 in Solingen) and Prof. Dr. Hans-Joachim Schulze (b. 1934 in Leipzig), who have shaped Bach studies in impressive ways for sixty years. Besides countless publications on Johann Sebastian Bach, source discoveries, and musical editions, the scholars also saw to it that Bach researchers continued to collaborate across the divide of the Iron Curtain. Following the fall of the Berlin Wall, both served, in succession, as director of the Bach-Archiv Leipzig, and developed the Leipzig research institute into a hub of international Bach activity. The award will be presented on June 17 in connection with the 2021 Leipzig Bach Festival.

Andreas Reize appointed Thomaskantor

The selection committee tasked with finding a successor for the Thomaskantor reached a decision in late December when they announced the appointment of Andreas Reize from Solothurn (Switzerland). Born in 1975, Reize studied church music at the Musikhochschule in Bern and Winterthur-Zürich. He also completed studies in historical performance practice at the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis as well as postgraduate work



Photo courtesy of www.andreasreize.com

in orchestral conducting at the Musikhochschule in Luzern. Currently he is founder and director of the Cantus Firmus Vokalensemble & Consort, is music director of Oper Schloss Waldegg, has led the children's choir "Singknaben der St. Ursenkathedrale Solothurn" since 2007, and since 2011 has directed the Gabrieli Choir Bern and the Zürich Bach Choir. Reize will take up the post of Thomaskantor in September 2021.

Recent Publications

Bach-Jahrbuch 106 (2020)

- **Friedhelm Krummacher** (Kiel), Luther Josquin Bach. Über Luthers Musikbegriff und Bachs Kirchenmusik.
- Hans-Joachim Schulze (Leipzig), Bachs Privatschüler Eine Nachlese.
- **Peter Wollny** (Leipzig), Überlegungen zu einigen Köthener Vokalwerken J. S. Bachs.
- Joachim Säckl (Naumburg) und Henrike Rucker (Leipzig), Höfische Festmusiken. Bachs "Jagdkantate" und "Schäferkantate" im Lichte der Weißenfelser Fürstengeburtstage von 1713 und 1725.
- **Pieter Dirksen** (Culemborg, NL), Auf den Spuren von Johann Sebastian Bachs Flötenkonzerten.
- Ernst Koch (Leipzig), "... alle wege steiff und vehst darüber halten". Zum theologischen Hintergrund des letzten Satzes von BWV 68.
- **Reiner Marquard** (Freiburg/Br.), Die Mündlichkeit der Predigt und die Rede von der ,streitenden Kirche' in Johann Sebastian Bachs Kantate "Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott" (BWV 80). Eine theologische Kritik an der Dichtung.
- **Thomas Daniel** (Köln), Carl Philipp Emanuel Bachs Choralsätze aus der Sammlung der Sing-Akademie zu Berlin und ihre Auswirkungen auf die Bewertung der Choraldrucke von Birnstiel und Breitkopf.
- Albrecht Lobenstein (Erfurt), Michael Bach (1687–1772) aus Mechterstädt. Organologische und genealogische Spuren. Kleine Beiträge
- Lynn Edwards Butler (Vancouver, B.C., Kanada), J. S. Bach in Altenburg: Ein bisher unbeachtetes Dokument.
- **Bernd Koska** (Leipzig), Die Bach-Thomaner Carl August Folger und Johann Gottfried Schönemann in Landsberg.
- **Gregory Butler** (Vancouver, B.C., Kanada), Beobachtungen am Eingangschor von Bachs Kantate "Halt im Gedächtnis Jesum Christ" BWV 67.
- Klaus Hofmann (Göttingen), Die Frühfassung der Matthäus-Passion – ohne Blockflöten?
- **Moira Leanne Hill** (Northfield/Minnesota), Neuerkenntnisse zu zwei Hamburger Kopisten Carl Philipp Emanuel Bachs.
- **Tomasz Górny** (Warszawa), Schrieb Johann Kuhnau einen dritten Teil der *Neuen Clavier Übung*?
- **Tatjana Schabalina** (Sankt Petersburg), Zur Aufführung des Oratoriums "Isaac, ein Vorbild des Erlösers" in der Leipziger Thomaskirche im Jahr 1754.

```
Besprechungen
```

Andrew Talle (Evanston/Illinois), Wer war Anna Magdalena Bach?

MEMBER NEWS

Stephen A. Crist edited a set of ten variations for violoncello and harpsichord on a Scottish tune ascribed to Johann Philipp Bach (1752–1846), the last surviving member of the Bach dynasty. The edition, *Aria scotese con variazzione* is published by A-R Editions in their Special Publications series.

Pieter Dirksen published an article, "Auf den Spuren von Bachs Flötenkonzerten," in *Bach-Jahrbuch* 106 (2020). Furthermore, a recording of the toccatas for harpsichord will appear this spring, accompanied by an essay which develops a new view of the meaning of and background to this early group of works: *J. S. Bach: Harpsichord Toccatas*, Etcetera KTC 1722 (2021).

On March 22, **Rebekah Franklin** successfully defended her dissertation, "J. S. Bach's *Passions* in Twenty-First-Century America: Festivalization, Theology, and Community Beyond the Liturgy," and will graduate with a Ph.D. in Musicology from Florida State University.

Moira Leanne Hill published an article in *Bach-Jahrbuch* 106 (2020) that uncovers the identities of two anonymous copyists who worked for C.P.E. Bach in Hamburg. It builds on her prior findings published in *Bach-Jahrbuch* 102 (2016), work for which she was awarded the ABS's Scheide Prize in 2018. She also contributed a chapter "Repaying Debt with Interest: The Revision of Borrowed Movements in C. P. E. Bach's Passions" to *Bach Perspectives* 13 (2020).

Robin Leaver announces the publication of his book *Bach Studies: Liturgy, Hymnology, and Theology* (Routledge), a collection of essays illuminating the varied ways in which Bach's sacred music was informed and shaped by the religious, ritual, and intellectual contexts of his time.

Daniel R. Melamed published an article "'Parallel Proportions' in J. S. Bach's Mu-

sic" in *Eighteenth-Century Music* 18, no. 1 (2021): 99–121.

Markus Rathey has co-edited (with J. Begbie and D. Chua) the volume *Theology, Music & Modernity: Struggles for Freedom* (Oxford University Press, 2021). The book explores the musical, theological, and philosophical discourses about freedom in the time between 1740 and 1850. Rathey's own article "Individual and Communal Freedom and the Performance History of the *St. Matthew Passion* by Bach and Mendelssohn" is part of a larger section on Bach's passion, which also includes essays by Bettina Varwig and R. Larry Todd.

David Schulenberg's podcast interview about his new Bach biography is live at <u>bachsocietyhouston.org</u>. His recording of chamber music mostly by J. G. and C. H. Graun is due out in May from Brilliant Classics. Recorded with an ensemble led by violinist Augusta McKay Lodge, the CD was to have included a new reconstruction of BWV 1038, a possible joint composition of J. S. and C. P. E. Bach; because it didn't fit on the CD, the sonata has been made available to all on Schulenberg's website (<u>faculty.wagner.edu/</u> <u>david-schulenberg</u>/).

Derek Stauff published an essay, "Music and the Leipzig Convention (1631)," in a special issue of the *Journal of Seventeenth-Century Music* (2020) titled "Thirty Years of War: Henrich Schütz and Music in Protestant Germany."

DIRECTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS

Bach Notes is published twice yearly (Fall and Spring) and mailed to all members and subscribers. Submissions for the Fall issue are due by 1 September, and should be in Microsoft Word, employ parenthetical citations, and follow the style guidelines of *The Chicago Manual of Style*. Submissions should be sent to Derek Stauff, dstauff@hillsdale.edu.

THE AMERICAN BACH SOCIETY

EXECUTIVE BOARD

Daniel R. Melamed, President (Indiana University) Ellen Exner, Vice President (New England Conservatory) Reginald L. Sanders, Secretary-Treasurer (Kenyon College)

ADVISORY BOARD

Term ending 2024 Stephen Crist (Emory University) Mary J. Greer (Cambridge, MA) Dana Marsh (Indiana University/Washington Bach Consort) Paul Walker (University of Notre Dame) Term ending 2022 Paul Corneilson (Packard Humanities Institute) Christina Fuhrmann (Baldwin-Wallace University/ Riemenschneider Bach Institute) Tanya Kevorkian (Millersville University) George B. Stauffer (Rutgers University)

Derek Stauff (Hillsdale College), Editor, *Bach Notes*, ex officio

Steven Zohn (Temple University), General Editor, *ex officio*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Steven Zohn, General Editor Derek Stauff, Editor, *Bach Notes* Evan Cortens, Web Editor Rebekah Franklin, Social Media Editor Daniel R. Melamed, President, *ex officio*

Term ending 2024

Daniel Boomhower (Dumbarton Oaks) Laura Buch (Packard Humanities Institute) Ellen Exner (New England Conservatory) Ruth Tatlow (Uppsala University) *Term ending 2022*

Matthew Dirst (University of Houston) David Schulenberg (Wagner College) Andrew Talle (Northwestern University) Bettina Varwig (Cambridge University)

MEMBERSHIP INFORMATION

Founded in 1972 as a chapter of the Neue Bachgesellschaft, the American Bach Society supports the study, performance, and appreciation of the music of Johann Sebastian Bach. Annual dues are \$50 (\$25 for students). Membership information and application materials are available online at the website listed below. Interested persons may also contact Reginald L. Sanders, Kenyon College Music Department, Storer Hall, Gambier, OH 43022, USA, or sandersr@kenyon.edu.

 8 2021 by The American Bach Society All rights reserved

Please visit the ABS website www.americanbachsociety.org for concert and festival listings